

# Public Accounts Committee

---

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

---

Meeting date: **Tuesday, 17 March 2015**

---

Meeting time: **08.30 – 10.56**

---

This meeting can be viewed on [Senedd TV](http://senedd.tv) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/2609>

Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales



---

## Concise Minutes:

### Assembly Members:

**Darren Millar AM (Chair)**  
**Jocelyn Davies AM**  
**Byron Davies AM (In place of William Graham AM)**  
**Mike Hedges AM**  
**Sandy Mewies AM**  
**Julie Morgan AM**  
**Jenny Rathbone AM**  
**Aled Roberts AM**

---

### Witnesses:

**Russell Bennett, Chartered Institution of Highways and Transportation (South Wales Branch)**  
**Rhodri-Gwynn Jones, Civil Engineering Contractors Association Wales**  
**David Meller, Chartered Institution of Highways and Transportation (North Wales Branch)**  
**Bob Lark, Cardiff University**  
**Kris Moodley, University of Leeds**  
**Nigel Smith, University of Leeds**

---

### Committee Staff:

**Michael Kay (Clerk)**  
**Leanne Hatcher (Second Clerk)**  
**Tanwen Summers (Deputy Clerk)**

---

---

Andrew Minnis (Researcher)  
Joanest Varney-Jackson (Legal Adviser)  
Jeremy Morgan (Wales Audit Office)  
Matthew Mortlock (Wales Audit Office)  
Huw Vaughan Thomas (Auditor General for Wales)  
Mike Usher (Wales Audit Office)

---

## **1 Managing Early Departures**

1.1 The Committee considered the Welsh Government's response to the Auditor General for Wales report on Managing Early Departures and a letter from the Auditor General for Wales providing further information requested by the Committee.

## **2 Forward Work Programme**

2.1 Members agreed the work programme for the summer term.

2.2 Jocelyn Davies absented herself from the meeting during discussion of an issue relating to a responsibility she previously held as a Minister.

## **3 Introductions, apologies and substitutions**

3.1 The Chair welcomed Members to the meeting.

3.2 Apologies were received from William Graham.

3.2 The Chair welcomed Byron Davies who was substituting for William Graham.

## **4 Papers to note – Public Accounts Committee**

4.1 The papers were noted with one small amendment.

4.2 The Committee agreed to write to the Chair of the Finance Committee inviting the Committee the opportunity to take forward further scrutiny on the Invest to Save fund.

## **5 Inquiry into value for money of Motorway and Trunk Road Investment: Evidence Session 2**

5.1 The Committee took evidence from academics from the University of Leeds and Cardiff University on its inquiry into value for money of Motorway and Trunk Road Investment.

## **6 Inquiry into value for money of Motorway and Trunk Road Investment: Evidence Session 3**

6.1 The Committee took evidence from the Civil Engineering Contractors Association Wales and Chartered Institution of Highways and Transportation North and South Wales Branches on its inquiry into value for money of Motorway and Trunk Road Investment.

6.2 Russell Bennett from the Chartered Institution of Highways and Transportation South Wales Branch agreed to provide further information on private investment.

## **7 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:**

7.1 The motion was agreed.

## **8 Inquiry into value for money of Motorway and Trunk Road Investment: Discussion of evidence**

8.1 The Committee considered the evidence received.